



Department of Philosophy
Fort Collins, Colorado 80523-1781
(970) 491-6315
FAX (970) 491-4900
<http://www.colostate.edu/Depts/Philosophy/>

January 17, 2014

To Whomever it May Concern:

I have been in the field of animal welfare for almost 40 years, and was recently credited in an award with being the person who has mitigated more pain in animals than anyone else in the 20th century. I was a major architect of 1985 U.S. federal laws protecting laboratory animals, and requiring control of pain inflicted on them in research, raising the number of papers on animal analgesia from 0 to 12,000 last year. I created the field of veterinary medical ethics in 1978 and pioneered in reforming surgical teaching and other invasive laboratories. I have given well over 1000 lectures on animal welfare all over the world, served on the Pew Commission on Industrial Farm Animal Production, and convinced Smithfield Farms, the world's largest pork producer, to phase out sow stalls, with much of the pork industry here and in Canada, Australia, and New Zealand following suit.

I have reviewed dozens of videos depicting animal abuse, not only in the United States, but also in Italy, Belgium, and France. My comments helped in legal proceedings against the abusers, which proceedings have in turn resulted in prison terms of up to five years. Most recently, I commented on unacceptable handling at a Colorado calf ranch that garnered national attention. The videos upon which I have commented include clearcut and egregious cruelty at dairies, slaughterhouses, equine facilities, swine operations, poultry production facilities, calf ranches, veal

operations, and rodeos. Of all the atrocity videos I have viewed, the current video of the slaughterhouse at Catelli Brothers must be ranked among the three worst.

Before commenting on details of this video, I must stress some basic philosophical presuppositions of anti-cruelty legislation in the United States. The point of such legislation is unfortunately not eliminating the majority of suffering that animals experience at human hands. Rather, it is meant to eliminate "unnecessary, deviant, purposeless, sadistic, intentional" infliction of suffering on animals on the grounds first expressed by St. Thomas Aquinas, that those humans who will do those sorts of things to animals will graduate to doing it to people, an insight fully confirmed by psychological research conducted over the last forty years. As such, this video is, as it were, a poster boy for animal cruelty. In it are depicted workers who clearly derive pleasure, or are at least amused by the animals' suffering. Such people should obviously not be allowed to work in situations where they can fulfill their deviant urges. Not only are the animals hurt, but such callous attitudes are contagious, and spread to other workers. In addition, there is no sign of good management, of the sort that would quickly put a stop to the sadism which is not only brutal, but counterproductive to the economic mission of the operation.

If what is depicted were not so horrific, some of the worker comments would almost be comic in a surrealistic way, as when a worker who acknowledges that the animal has a broken leg, i.e., qualifies as a downer animal who should be euthanized immediately, also declares that despite the broken leg, the animal is "lazy" because he refuses to get up and walk, and that he walked a significant amount earlier.

It is well-known in the cattle industry that when the animals are significantly stressed, their need for water and their thirst increases significantly. For me personally, watching the investigator surreptitiously providing water to the calf is one of the most touching and gripping parts of the video, probably as a result of the stark contrast between this act of fundamental decency and mercy and the remainder of the behavior depicted, which shows not one iota of compassion or moral concern for the animals.

Lest someone think that isolated instances are being employed to indict the operation, the videos clearly show that multiple, repeat stunnings are commonplace at the plant. Except on very rare occasions such as equipment failure, a single shot

with the bolt should be enough to render the animal unconscious. This plant would therefore fail any audit with which I am familiar.

The conclusion to be drawn from this video data is self-evident. This plant should be closed down immediately, and the workers should be prosecuted and never allowed to work with animals again.

It is very ironic that earlier this month I was asked to evaluate a video showing significant animal abuse by workers at a calf ranch in Colorado. That video has resulted in charges of cruelty being leveled against the perpetrators, as well as a major outcry from the general public, and from a unified Colorado agricultural community. This current video, if anything, depicts far more horrifying and nightmarish abuses of cattle by workers. In the culture of concern for animals suffering that has been growing in the US over the last four decades, places like this Catelli plant must be closed down, and the sadistic workers and unconcerned managers should endure profound punishment, if the public is to ever trust the meat industry.

The rabbi depicted is also criminally culpable, as he should never have completed the ritual slaughter process on the injured animal but rather demanded euthanasia, as the meat is not kosher. The cynical behavior displayed will rightly make the public increasingly suspicious of ritual slaughter. The rabbi inserting a hand into the throat of an animal who has had his throat cut, is a patent violation of Jewish law. One can also doubt his competence, as the animals remain conscious for far too long. Witnessing behavior like this makes me ashamed of coming from the Jewish tradition.

Sincerely,

Bernard E. Rollin

University Distinguished Professor
Professor of Philosophy
Professor of Animal Sciences
Professor of Biomedical Sciences
University Bioethicist
Colorado State University

