

Dissection vs. Alternatives: A Cost Comparison

How does the cost of buying dead animals for dissection compare with buying humane alternatives? The figures below are based on hypothetical school's needs for a three-year period. Reusable materials (dissection tools, trays, computer programs, models, charts, etc.) are treated as a one-time purchase. Costs are based on a ratio of two students per animal dissected (45 animals a year, 135 animals over three years). This comparison assumes that the school already has computers, CD-ROM players, and VCRs. Because dissection manuals are needed for dissection but are also useful stand-alone study guides, they are included under both Alternatives and Dissection headings. Low and high prices of preserved animals were obtained from the Carolina Biological Supply Company Catalog at www.carolina.com (2004 prices) and the Alternatives (2004 prices) were selected from available lists, catalogs, websites and databases. Numbers of alternative materials were derived based on the assumption that students would not be using all alternatives at one time.

Cat

Alternatives		Dissection	
Anatomy model (x2)	\$798.00	High cost per animal (60.00 x 135)	\$8100.00
Dissection video (40 minutes)	\$ 64.50	Low cost per animal (25.00 x 135)	\$3375.00
CatWorks (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$499.95	64 page dissection manual (x30)	\$ 298.50
Catlab (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$579.00	Supplies (x135)	<u>\$1500.00</u>
Biocam dissection chart (x30)	\$148.50		
64 pg. dissection manual (x30)	<u>\$298.50</u>		
	\$2388.45		
		High cost - \$9898.50	
		Low cost - \$5173.50	

(Alternatives can save between \$2785.05 and \$7510.05 over a three year period)

Fetal Pig

Alternatives		Dissection	
Fetal pig model (x2)	\$650.00	High cost per animal (18.35 x 135)	\$2477.25
Dissectionworks (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$418.95	Low cost per animal (6.20 x 135)	\$ 837.00
Drylab 3D fetal pig (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$498.00	56 page dissection manual (x30)	\$ 298.50
Dissection video (30 minutes)	\$ 64.50	Supplies (x135)	<u>\$1500.00</u>
BioCam dissection chart (x30)	\$148.50		
56 page dissection manual (x30)	<u>\$298.50</u>		
	\$2078.45		
		High cost - \$4275.75	
		Low cost - \$2635.50	

(Alternatives can save between \$557.05 and \$2197.30 over a three year period)

Bullfrog

Alternatives		Dissection	
The Digital Frog 2 (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$599.00	High cost per animal (14.70 x 135)	\$1984.50
Dissectionworks (CD-ROM) (x10)	\$418.95	Low cost per animal (5.45 x 135)	\$ 735.75
Dissection video (25 minutes)	\$ 64.50	88 page dissection manual (x30)	\$ 388.50
Great American Bullfrog model (x2)	\$730.00	Supplies (x135)	<u>\$1500.00</u>
Frog Lab Investigation model (x3)	\$ 99.95		
Biocam dissection chart (x30)	\$148.50		
88 page dissection manual (x30)	<u>\$388.50</u>		
	\$2449.40		
		High cost - \$3873.00	
		Low cost - \$2624.25	

(Alternatives can save between \$174.85 and \$1423.60 over a three year period)